                 IETF ISOC Board of Trustee Appointment Procedures

Status of this Memo

Copyright Notice

Abstract

   This memo outlines the process by which the IETF makes a selection of
   an Internet Society (ISOC) Board of Trustees appointment.

1. Introduction

   The Internet Society (ISOC) provides organizational and financial
   support for the IETF. As stipulated in ISOC's by-laws the IETF is
   called upon to name 3 Trustees to its Board (BoT), with staggered 3
   year terms. This requires that the IETF name one Trustee each year.

   This memo outlines the process by which the IETF makes that
   selection. This process will also be used in the event of mid-term
   vacancies that may arise with IETF nominated Board positions.

1.1. Overview of Selection Process

   In brief, this document describes the timeframe and procedures for
   the IAB to solicit public input and make a selection for the open
   position each year.

1.2. Rationale

   An alternative approach to making a selection for these positions
   would be to use the IETF's NomCom (RFC 2727 [1] and its revisions).
   However, that NomCom is chartered and defined specifically to the
   task of making selections for IETF organization tasks, and the ISOC
   BoT appointment process does not fit that in 2 ways:

1. the timeframe of the appointment does not mesh with the IETF
    appointment cycle

2. the nature of the deliberations and the type of information
    solicited would be significantly different for an external
    appointment, such as this appointment to the ISOC BoT

The first issue (timing) could be resolved fairly easily for this
specific appointment. The second issue is more general, and not
reasonably reconciled with the IETF NomCom task as currently
specified.

The process described in RFC 2727 is oriented toward soliciting
feedback from the IETF community with respect to individuals and
technical positions with which they have personal experience. To
make a good decision on external appointments, in general, the NomCom
would have to understand the requirements for those positions, and
attempt to evaluate candidates for a very different set of skills
than is required of IAB/IESG members. It might also require
soliciting feedback from outside the IETF community.   There is no
question that the individuals that constitute the IETF NomCom each
year have the competence to carry out such a search; the issue is
that it is a very different task, would require additional time and
resources, and therefore is a side effort that could very well
undermine the effectiveness of the NomCom in carrying out its primary
task for the IETF.

By contrast, the IAB is chartered to be responsible for IETF external
liaisons, is a standing body that works with ISOC (and the ISOC
Board), and therefore has a working knowledge of the requirements of
the specific position discussed here.

At some future point, if there is a more general need to make
external appointments, the IETF may consider broadening the scope of
the IETF NomCom role, or create a separate nominating committee for
such external non-liaison appointments. This document proposes that
is not necessary or desirable for the purposes of this one annual
appointment.

2. Desirable Qualifications and Selection Criteria for an
     IETF-Nominated ISOC Trustee

    Candidates for an ISOC Trustee should have a demonstrable involvement
    in the IETF with a particular focus on active participation in IETF
    Working Groups.

The candidate is expected to possess clearly demonstrated technical competence in Internet technology, and be able to articulate technology issues such that the ISOC Board can be provided with sound technical perspectives. The candidate is also expected to be able to understand the respective roles and responsibilities of the IETF and ISOC and be able to articulate these roles within both organizational communities.

The candidate will also be expected to exercise all the duties of an ISOC Board member, including fiduciary responsibility, setting of policies, oversight of the operation of the Society, representing the interests of the members and stakeholders of the Society and participation in all Board meetings and Board activity programs.

The candidate is not a representative or a delegate of the IETF and is not chartered to represent the IETF or the IETF Standards Process within the ISOC Board or the broader ISOC community. However it is expected that the candidate would be able to call on experts in the IETF community as required, to ensure that the ISOC Board receives the highest quality technical advice available.

3. IETF ISOC Board of Trustees Selection Process

3.1. Nominations and eligibility

Each year, the IAB will make a public call for nominations on the ietf-announce@ietf.org mailing list. The public call will specify the manner by which nominations will be accepted and the means by which the list of nominees will be published.

Self-nominations are permitted. Along with the name and contact information for each candidate, details about the candidate's background and qualifications for the position should be attached to the nomination. All IETF participants, including working group chairs, IETF NomCom members, IAB and IESG members are eligible for nomination.

IAB and IESG members who accept nomination will recuse themselves from selection and confirmation discussions respectively.

3.2. Selection

The IAB will publish the list of nominated persons, review the nomination material, and make a selection.

The selection criteria will include additional consideration of any
nominated candidates who are concurrently members of the IAB or IESG
members such that at the time of selection no more than two of the
three IETF-appointed ISOC Trustees are IAB and IESG members.

3.3. Confirmation

The IESG will act as the confirming body for the selection. In the
event that the IESG determines not to confirm the nominated
candidate, the IESG will provide the IAB with the basis for this
determination and the IAB will nominate another candidate.

3.4. Timeframe

ISOC expects to seat new Board members at its annual general meeting
in June of each year. Basic timeframe requirements for the IETF
process are as follows:

o 4-6 weeks for solicitation of nominations

o 4-6 weeks for review of nominees, deliberation and selection

o 4-6 weeks for confirmation (and re-selection as necessary) and
   delivery to ISOC

In January of each year, the IAB will announce the specific dates for
the IETF ISOC Trustee selection process for that year (taking into
account the particular dates of the first IETF meeting of the year,
etc), following the guidelines above.

3.5. Mid-term Vacancies

This document describes the process for the general, annual
appointment of ISOC Trustees to fill the seats of Trustees whose
terms are ending. However, if an IETF-appointed Trustee is unable to
serve his or her full term, the IAB may, at its discretion,
immediately select a replacement to serve the remainder of the term
using the interim process defined in Section 3.5.1. If the IAB does
not invoke the interim process, the next annual selection process
will fill the vacancy (if the vacant term does not end at that point)
as well as the regular appointment for that selection cycle.

3.5.1. Interim Appointment Process

If the IAB elects to fill the mid-term vacancy before the next annual
selection, a separate timeline will be announced and the rest of the
process described in this document will be followed.

4. Security Considerations

   This document does not describe any technical protocols and has no
   implications for network security.

5. Intellectual Property Statement

   The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any
   intellectual property or other rights that might be claimed to
   pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in
   this document or the extent to which any license under such rights
   might or might not be available; neither does it represent that it
   has made any effort to identify any such rights. Information on the
   IETF's procedures with respect to rights in standards-track and
   standards-related documentation can be found in BCP-11. Copies of
   claims of rights made available for publication and any assurances of
   licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to
   obtain a general license or permission for the use of such
   proprietary rights by implementors or users of this specification can
   be obtained from the IETF Secretariat.

   The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any
   copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary
   rights which may cover technology that may be required to practice
   this standard. Please address the information to the IETF Executive
   Director.

6. References

   [1] Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall
        Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees", BCP
        10, RFC 2727, February 2000.

Appendix A.   IAB Members at the time of this writing

    Bernard Aboba

    Harald Alvestrand

    Rob Austein

    Leslie Daigle

    Patrik Faltstrom

    Sally Floyd

    Mark Handley

    Geoff Huston

    Jun-ichiro (Itojun) Hagino

    Charlie Kaufman

    James Kempf

    Eric Rescorla

    Mike St.Johns

Authors' Addresses

    Leslie Daigle
    Editor

    Internet Architecture Board
    IAB

    EMail: iab@iab.org